

Subject Matter Expert Evaluation Guide for HR

OFFICIAL USE NOTICE: This material is intended exclusively for use by USA Staffing Customers and is not to be distributed without approval from the USA Staffing Program Office. This communication may contain information that is proprietary, privileged or confidential or otherwise legally exempt from disclosure. If you have received this document in error, please notify the USA Staffing Program Office immediately and delete all copies of the presentation.

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|----|
| What Is a Subject Matter Expert Evaluation? | 3 |
| Structured Resume Review | 3 |
| Questions to Consider in Deciding Whether to Use a Structured Resume Review..... | 3 |
| What Are the Benefits of a Structured Resume Review? | 3 |
| When Is a Structured Resume Review Recommended?..... | 4 |
| When Is Use of a Structured Resume Review Inappropriate? | 4 |
| What Resources Are Required? | 5 |
| Who Can Serve as an SME Rater? | 5 |
| Is Structured Resume Review Training Available? | 6 |
| What to know when using an SME Evaluation in USA Staffing..... | 7 |
| Developing Content | 8 |
| Developing Subject Matter Expert (SME) Evaluation Items | 8 |
| Adding Specialized Experience Statement to USA Staffing | 10 |
| Assessment Package Tab..... | 11 |
| Assessment Information..... | 11 |
| Competencies | 12 |
| SME Evaluation Items | 12 |
| Screen-Out Criteria | 13 |
| Test Plan..... | 13 |
| Checklist..... | 13 |
| Completing the Assessment Package | 13 |
| Language for Job Opportunity Announcement Text Page..... | 13 |
| Sending and updating SME Review | 14 |
| Review Information | 14 |
| Review Assignments..... | 15 |
| Completing the SME Review | 15 |
| Monitoring Evaluation Progress..... | 15 |
| Reviewing Evaluation | 15 |
| Implementation Success Factors | 17 |

What Is a Subject Matter Expert Evaluation?

Structured Resume Review

OPM defines a Structured Resume Review as a screening (pass/fail) assessment whereby a trained panel of two or more SMEs follow a systematic process to review an applicant's resume and come to agreement on whether the applicant has the required specialized experience necessary to successfully perform the job. The Structured Resume Review is intended to screen out individuals whose resumes do not demonstrate the specialized experience required. This method does not identify best qualified applicants, provide a numerical score, or determine a category rating placement.

A Subject Matter Expert (SME) Evaluation is one of four **Assessment Types** available in USA Staffing, the other three being Questionnaire, Manual, and External (i.e., USA Hire). An SME Evaluation allows HR Users to interact directly with the SMEs who will evaluate applicants using different **Assessment Methods**. The Structured Resume Review functionality in USA Staffing collects the SMEs' evaluations and justifications, determines if there are discrepancies between SMEs, brings in a tiebreaker SME as needed, and presents the information in an organized way to the HR User.

A self-paced online training course (approximately 3 to 4 hours) is available to all Federal agencies at no charge through the USA Staffing Online Course Portal at <https://usastaffing.usalearning.gov/login/index.php>

Questions to Consider in Deciding Whether to Use a Structured Resume Review

Assessment strategies that involve SMEs in the applicant evaluation process can help to reduce reliance on self-evaluation questionnaires and promote the use of multiple assessment hurdles. A Structured Resume Review is one way to leverage subject matter expertise in the applicant screening process. Below are questions to consider in deciding whether to include a Structured Resume Review as part of your assessment strategy for a given position.

What Are the Benefits of a Structured Resume Review?

A structured and systematic resume review process that includes a panel of trained raters, clear evaluation criteria, and a standardized process can help agencies screen applicants in a reliable, valid, and effective manner. Agencies can leverage SME technical knowledge to improve the quality of candidates referred to the hiring official. The Structured Resume Review, when implemented consistent with OPM guidance and best practices (see section on available OPM training below), also

meets the Executive Order 13932 requirement that applicants must complete one or more assessments that do not rely solely on their self-evaluation.

When Is a Structured Resume Review Recommended?



The SME Evaluation assessment type **cannot** be used in vacancies that have multiple grades, multiple series, or multiple specialties.

The nature of the vacancy is important to consider when determining if a Structured Resume Review is appropriate to incorporate into a given assessment strategy. Generally, the Structured Resume Review is recommended only for situations meeting all of the following criteria.

- Highly specialized or technical jobs for which SMEs are in a better position than HR professionals to interpret experience as described in applicants' resumes.
- Higher graded positions (i.e., GS-12 and above, or equivalent).
- Positions for which there is no education substitution; the applicant can qualify based on specialized experience only.
- Smaller applicant pools or recruitments where there is control over the number of applicants moving forward (i.e., through application caps or a hurdled process)
- Larger applicant pools or recruitments for which multiple hurdles are being applied, multiple selections are being made and/or agencies can dedicate a larger number of SMEs.
- Vacancies with a single rating combination (i.e., single series and grade/specialty).



Depending on agency policy, your assessment strategy, and other position considerations, agencies can consider using applicant caps, passing scores (based on minimum required proficiency) and multiple hurdles (business necessity cut points) to cull down the applicant pool. See the [Multiple Hurdles Guide](#) and the [Assessment Questionnaires Passing Score FAQs](#) at the [USA Staffing Resource Center](#) for more information.

When Is Use of a Structured Resume Review Inappropriate?

Structured Resume Reviews are designed only for use in determining whether applicants possess the required specialized experience to successfully perform the job. Structured Resume Review methodology and/or the current associated functionality in USA Staffing are NOT appropriate (and in some cases not permitted) for use in:

- Determining if an applicant meets the Individual Occupational Requirements (IORs)/Basic Requirements for a position, such as educational degrees, specific course work, certifications, or general experience. The review to ensure an applicant meets the IOR/Basic Requirement should be conducted by an HR professional prior to the Structured Resume Review.

- Reviewing transcripts to determine if an applicant meets education requirements that can serve as a substitution for specialized experience.
- Determining if an applicant meets a selective placement factor that involves a certification, license, or other requirement that involves a review of supporting documentation other than a resume.
- Recruitments that include more than one grade, series, or specialty.

What Resources Are Required?

Structured Resume Reviews require participation and collaboration among key stakeholders. Before including a Structured Resume Review in your assessment strategy, determine the availability of key stakeholders and other resources/processes to support the reviews. The list below assumes you already have a current job analysis for the target position.

- **Hiring Manager and/or SMEs** – To participate in the development and review of the specialized experience requirements.
- **SMEs** –To remain in compliance with of Executive Order 13932, a minimum of three SMEs are needed to review and rate the resumes. USA Staffing uses a tiebreaker approach to resolve discrepancies between raters, whereby a third tiebreaker SME is required to review the documentation and make a final determination. While a minimum of three SMEs is required, the use of additional SMEs is recommended as it can help to reduce the burden on any one SME. In addition, additional SMEs may be needed in the event an SME needs to recuse themselves from the rating process. SMEs serving as raters are required to attend a training and calibration session.
- **HR Personnel and/or Personnel Psychologists** – To lead development of specialized experience statements and to train SME raters on the resume review process, including a calibration practice exercise. See additional training resources described below.
- **HR Personnel** – To facilitate the overall process and review rating justifications provided by SMEs, including addressing questions and resolving any issues that may arise.
- **Business Processes** – To support identification and scheduling of SMEs, SME training and calibration, review of rating justifications, and protection of personally identifiable information (PII).



Generally, a single SME can evaluate three to four specialized experience statements using a resume in about 10 to 15 minutes. Depending on their other responsibilities and the rating timeline, a general rule of thumb is to ask SMEs to rate no more than a maximum of 50 applicants.

Who Can Serve as an SME Rater?

SMEs are generally high-performing incumbents and/or supervisors who are highly knowledgeable about the work performed in the occupation at the target grade level. SMEs need to be at or above the grade level they are reviewing resumes for. It is critical that SMEs have first-hand knowledge of the

technical/specialized experience required (i.e., at least one year (52 weeks, full-time) equivalent to the next lower grade level in the Federal service or comparable level of experience from outside the Federal service) to be successful in the occupation.

Below is a summary of common requirements for SMEs serving as raters for the Structured Resume Review. The requirements may vary depending on an agency's internal HR policies.

- Highly knowledgeable regarding the tasks and competencies needed to be successful in the target position.
- Current incumbents or supervisors at or above the grade level of the position being recruited who have been in the position for a minimum of 6 months.
- Representative of the incumbent/supervisor population (e.g., agency, office, demographics).
- Able to articulate key behaviors and experience that differentiate a qualified applicant from an unqualified applicant.
- Available to participate fully in the training and resume review process.
- **Not** the selecting official or direct supervisor for the target position.
- **Not** applying for the target position under the current hiring action.
- **Not** a contractor.

Is Structured Resume Review Training Available?

Yes. A self-paced web-based Structured Resume Review training course (approximately 3 to 4 hours) is available to all Federal agencies at no charge. The course, not specific to any one talent acquisition system, is designed for experienced HR professionals proficient in:

- Conducting job analyses
- Writing specialized experience statements
- Providing direction to hiring managers/SMEs (e.g., training or focus groups)
- Federal staffing

The training, which includes five lessons, covers both the pre-recruitment and post-announcement phases of the Structured Resume Review process. Participants have an opportunity to measure their understanding through knowledge checks and practical exercises in each section. Resources are provided to assist participants in applying the concepts in real-world situations.

The training is designed to provide participants with the knowledge required to successfully manage a Structured Resume Review process including how to:

- Identify when a Structured Resume Review may be an appropriate part of the assessment strategy for a given vacancy.
- Identify and recruit appropriate SMEs.
- Collaborate with SMEs to review job analyses and develop/review specialized experience statements.
- Conduct or oversee a Structured Resume Review process.

- Prepare appropriate rating documentation.
- Identify and avoid rater biases and prohibited personnel practices.

Any Federal employee with a Federal email address (e.g., .gov, .mil) can access the course by creating an account on the USA Staffing Online Course Portal at <https://usastaffing.usalearning.gov/login/index.php>. Supported browsers include Microsoft Edge, Mozilla Firefox, and Google Chrome.

What to know when using an SME Evaluation in USA Staffing

The system defaults in USA Staffing, when selecting the SME Evaluation assessment type, are designed for compliance with the requirements of Executive Order 13932. At a high level, a Structured Resume Review that meets the Executive Order involves the following steps:

- Two SMEs independently review an applicant’s resume against each specialized experience requirement targeted for the resume review.
- Each SME independently determines whether or not the applicant meets each specialized experience requirement based on the content of the applicant’s resume.
- Each SME provides a justification for each Yes/No rating.
 - When rating ‘Yes’ (resume reflects the required experience), SMEs indicate where in the resume they found support for their rating (i.e., year(s) experience gained, as well as position title as needed for clarity).
 - When rating ‘No’ (resume does not reflect the required experience), SMEs indicate that the resume reflects insufficient evidence of the required experience, providing justification needed to help others to retrace their decision.
- If the two SMEs disagree on one or more specialized experience requirement(s), a third tiebreaker SME reviews documentation from the two SMEs to make a final determination if it will determine whether or not the applicant is qualified. Disagreements that would not change the applicant’s qualification outcome are not sent to a tiebreaker.

It is important to note that, although the steps outlined above reflect the system defaults and are consistent with Executive Order 13932 requirements, USA Staffing functionality offers flexibilities. The system will permit a single SME to carry out a resume review. The system also allows for configuration for SMEs’ justification to be optional for each rating. However, deviating from the system defaults may result in an assessment process that is not compliant with EO 13932 resulting in the need for an additional assessment prior to certification.

When planning to use the SME Evaluation Assessment Type to carry out a Structured Resume Review, keep in mind the following:

- SME Evaluations can be added to an Assessment Package Template or an individual vacancy.
- Assessments of any type must be added to your vacancy before it is released and opened on USAJOBS.
- Your vacancy must accept and require resumes.
- You should place language in the How You Will Be Evaluated section of the announcement that explains to the applicant any additional assessment steps that will occur after they submit their application (see sample wording in Language for Job Opportunity Announcement Text Page section of this guide).
- SME Evaluations can be combined with other types of assessments in the same assessment package, including other SME Evaluations, if needed. The settings for each assessment are independent of each other and can be configured on their respective Assessment Information pages according to your agency's needs and internal business rules.



The only assessment method currently available under the SME Evaluation assessment type is the Structured Resume Review. We will add additional assessment methods as we continue to refine system functionality.

Developing Content

Developing Subject Matter Expert (SME) Evaluation Items

The key difference between the Minimum Qualifications Items and the SME Evaluation Items is that applicants rate themselves on the Minimum Qualifications Items and SMEs rate applicants on the SME Evaluation Items. The SME Evaluation Items serve as the criteria for SME ratings when conducting a Structured Resume Review in USA Staffing. The specialized experience requirements serve as the basis for the SME Evaluation Items. Writing effective specialized experience requirements is critical to the success of a Structured Resume Review assessment process.

Depending on the position, as well as other assessments being used, specialized experience for most positions can be defined by three to four discrete behaviorally based statements. Generally, applicants must have at least one year (52 weeks) of full-time experience equivalent to the next lower grade level in the Federal service (or comparable level of experience from outside the Federal service) performing each behavior to meet the specialized experience requirements.

Best practice criteria for writing specialized experience requirements are reviewed below. Additional considerations when developing the JOA, AQ Minimum Qualification Items, and SME Evaluation Items are also discussed.

When writing and reviewing specialized experience requirements with your SMEs, ensure they are based on current job analysis information and that wording for each requirement is:

- Clear, specific, behavioral (observable) and unambiguous.
 - Evaluate every word by questioning, ‘Will it be interpreted the same way by all applicants (and raters)?’
 - Evaluate the action verb by questioning, ‘Is this the behavior we are most interested in verifying?’
- Readily demonstrable and verifiable based on a resume.
 - Identify experience that you can expect to find in a resume.
 - Determine the most appropriate level of specificity for the position. For example, for a GS-2210/14 Information Technology (IT) Product Manager, one might expect to see experience that reflects ‘Managing an IT project involving multiple stakeholder groups.’ However, ‘Developing a project plan and conducting a stakeholder analysis’ may be too narrow.
- Attainable or realistic for applicants applying to the position (i.e., representative of the next lower grade level).
 - Consider experience that applicants at the next lower grade level (or in an equivalent position outside the Federal sector) will have had the opportunity to gain.
- Reflective of critical experience required for entry into the target position (i.e., experience obtained at the next lower grade level).
 - Remember the reference is a minimally competent applicant just entering the target grade. It is not a “super-star.” The reference is not a borderline unsuccessful applicant, either. The reference is a qualified applicant, but at a “minimum” level.
- Non-redundant.
 - Write requirements that are independent and do not overlap with one another.
- Begin each item with the phrase, “Resume reflects at least one year of specialized experience equivalent to the [insert next lower] grade level” (see examples below). You also will be required to include an item header. The item header can be an abbreviated version of the specialized experience requirement (see Sample 1 below). The item header also may be the competency associated with the specialized experience requirement (see Sample 2 below).

Sample 1:

Leading Customer Experience Projects

Resume reflects at least one year of specialized experience equivalent to the GS-12 level leading customer experience projects that involve multidisciplinary teams and multiple research methods (e.g., qualitative and quantitative).

Creating Design Artifacts

Resume reflects at least one year of specialized experience equivalent to the GS-12 level creating design artifacts (e.g., journey maps, personas, wireframes, storyboards) to improve product or service delivery.

Facilitating Workshops

Resume reflects at least one year of specialized experience equivalent to the GS-12 level facilitating workshops or other interactive sessions using inclusive methods and practices (e.g., interviews, co-design) to build buy-in and gather experience insights among customers/stakeholders.

Sample 2:

Microbiology

Resume reflects at least one year of specialized experience equivalent to the GS-12 level planning microbiological field and laboratory investigations involving novel or difficult-to-identify pathogens.

Serotyping

Resume reflects at least one year of specialized experience equivalent to the GS-12 level serotyping immune-based and/or molecular assays to detect emerging threats such as viruses, bacteria, proteins and/or peptides.

Encapsulation

Resume reflects at least one year of specialized experience equivalent to the GS-12 level utilizing nanoparticle and/or microparticle production processes for encapsulation and/or characterization of encapsulated material.

Aerosolization

Resume reflects at least one year of specialized experience equivalent to the GS-12 level aerosolizing nano and/or microencapsulated material.



When developing and reviewing specialized experience requirements with your SMEs, provide them with sample resumes from an announcement for the same position (series/grade) to gauge whether they can determine if the resume reflects each specialized experience requirement. If appropriate resumes are not available, ask SMEs to provide you with examples of acceptable language they would expect to see on applicant resumes that would satisfy each specialized experience requirement.

Adding Specialized Experience Statement to USA Staffing

Once Specialized Experience Requirements/Statements have been developed, HR Users will add them to USA Staffing.

Assessment Package Tab

If there aren't any assessments in the vacancy's Assessment Package, you'll be prompted to choose an Assessment Path.

Online Help has instructions for adding a SME Evaluation assessment:


<https://support-usastaffing.opm.gov/hc/en-us/articles/45424330299155-Creating-a-SME-Evaluation-assessment>

Assessment Information

PLEASE NOTE: The SME Evaluation assessment type is available as an option only if the vacancy contains a single rating combination, such as GS-0403-13. SME Evaluation will **not** appear as an option if the vacancy has multiple grades, series, or specialties. If additional rating combinations are added after the Assessment Package is completed, USA Staffing will automatically mark the Assessment Package as incomplete and prevent HR Users from completing the Assessment Package until the additional rating combinations or the SME Evaluation assessment is removed.

Select either Structured Resume Review (EO Compliant) or Structured Resume Review from the Assessment Method dropdown.

- a. When you select Structured Resume Review (EO Compliant), USA Staffing will set the number of SME evaluations required to 2 and require evaluation justification notes for all responses. These defaults help the HR User ensure the assessment meets the intent of Executive Order 13932 (EO). Selecting this option doesn't guarantee the assessment meets the EO's intent but rather ensures the HR User is meeting minimum requirements to do so.
- b. When you select Structured Resume Review, USA Staffing allows the HR User the flexibility to set the number of SME evaluations to 1 or 2, and require evaluation justification notes only for disqualifying responses, only for qualifying responses, or for all responses, according to the agency's needs. Keep in mind, however, that an assessment requiring fewer than 2 SME evaluations and not requiring justification notes for all responses will not meet the requirements of EO 13932.

It is important to ensure you have the appropriate number of SMEs trained and  available to perform the SME evaluations for each vacancy. You may add additional SMEs to perform SME Evaluations at any time. However, once the vacancy is released to USAJOBS, changes to the Assessment Information page may have a negative impact on your assessment and could cause it to be unusable.

Competencies

SME Evaluation type assessments do not require the use of Competencies. If you do choose to use them, you can add them on the Competencies tab by selecting them from an existing competency network, or if you have the proper permissions, by creating them manually.



Any competencies you add to your SME Evaluation type assessment will be displayed in USAJOBS if you include a *Competencies List* or *Competencies Bullets* data insert in your announcement. If you're assessing the same competency between multiple assessments, make sure you use the same Competency ID in each of those assessments, so they aren't duplicated in the data insert list.

SME Evaluation Items

The SME Evaluation Items page is where you add the specialized experience requirements developed in the above Developing Specialized Experience Requirements section of this guide. These specialized experience requirements will be used by SMEs when reviewing each resume to evaluate if an applicant possesses the required specialized experience.

These specialized experience requirements are not the same as the Individual Occupation Requirements (IORs) or other basic requirements for the advertised position which may include education requirements or selective placement factors which are typically confirmed through supporting documentation such as transcripts, certifications, and licenses. HR Users should conduct the review of Individual Occupation Requirements (IORs) or other basic requirements prior to sending the SME Review. The SME will only have access to the applicants' resumes when conducting the SME Review.

Each SME Evaluation Item requires a header and a stem. The header may be the competency associated with, or an abbreviated version of, the specialized experience requirement. The stem is the specialized experience requirement phrased in a way that prompts a "yes/no" response from the SME. For example:

(Header) Microbiology

(Stem) Resume reflects at least one year of specialized experience equivalent to the GS-12 level planning microbiological field and laboratory investigations involving novel or difficult-to-identify pathogens.

SME Evaluation Items can be added by importing them from the SME Evaluation Items Library or by adding them manually.

Online Help has instructions for adding a SME Evaluation Item from a Library:

<https://support-usastaffing.opm.gov/hc/en-us/articles/45424315134483-Adding-an-item-to-a-SME-Evaluation-from-the-Library>

Online Help has instructions for adding a SME Evaluation Item Manually:

<https://support-usastaffing.opm.gov/hc/en-us/articles/45424312545299-Adding-an-item-to-a-SME-Evaluation>

Screen-Out Criteria

Each SME Evaluation Item is a Screen-out Question, so each one will need its own Screen-out Criteria. The HR User adds these on the Screen-Out Criteria page. Helpful tip: to keep things organized, use the SME Evaluation Item Header as the name for the screen-out.

Online Help has instructions for adding a screen-out:

<https://support-usastaffing.opm.gov/hc/en-us/articles/45424328987283-Adding-a-screen-out>

The default code is **IQSM** - *You are ineligible for this position because subject matter experts have determined you do not meet the required qualifications as described in the job announcement.*

Test Plan

The Test Plan page is where the HR User ensures the screen-outs are correctly configured through various test scenarios.

Online Help has instructions for creating a Test Plan:

<https://support-usastaffing.opm.gov/hc/en-us/articles/45424335041171-Test-Plan-Overview>

USA Staffing only requires one passing test scenario to complete the assessment, but a best practice is to create a qualifying (i.e., ELTE) and at least one disqualifying (i.e., IQSM) scenario. Regardless of the number of scenarios you create, all must have green checkmarks.

Checklist

The Checklist page performs some behind-the-scenes validations to make sure the SME Evaluation Assessment is configured correctly. If your assessment passes, you'll see all green checkmarks.

Online Help has more information about the assessment checklist page:

<https://support-usastaffing.opm.gov/hc/en-us/articles/45424338809363-Assessment-Checklist-Overview>

Completing the Assessment Package

At this point, you are finished creating the SME Evaluation assessment. You are now free to add additional assessments and hurdles, if needed, or complete the assessment package and continue with the announcement.

Language for Job Opportunity Announcement Text Page

In addition to following best practice when developing the specialized experience requirements to list under the 'Qualifications' section of the Job Opportunity Announcement (JOA), there are several other considerations when developing a JOA for a vacancy that includes a Structured Resume Review. First, depending on agency policy and the nature of the announcement, consider if you want to impose a page limit on resumes. Second, inform applicants that a Structured Resume Review assessment

process will be used. Finally, inform applicants of information that should be included in their resume. See sample JOA language below.

Sample language for ‘How You Will Be Evaluated’ section:

Structured Resume Review. Subject matter experts (SMEs) will review your resume to determine your technical qualifications for this position based on the required specialized experience. SMEs will review ONLY four (4) pages of your resume, starting at your work experience. SMEs will not review additional information beyond your resume (e.g., cover letter, links embedded in your resume). Applicants passing the structured resume review will move on to the next phase of the assessment process.

Sample language under ‘Required Documents’ section:

A resume which includes a list of all significant jobs held and duties performed, with dates specified in month and year, and indicates hours worked per week. If military or a civilian Federal employee, you must include your rank and/or grade. IMPORTANT NOTE: Only four (4) pages of your resume, starting at your work experience will be reviewed to determine your technical qualifications for this position based on the specialized experience. Additional information beyond your resume (e.g., cover letters, links to additional information) will not be reviewed. In describing your experience, please be clear and specific. We may not make assumptions regarding your experience. Overstating your qualifications and/or experience in your application materials may result in your removal from consideration.

Sending and updating SME Review

A Subject Matter Expert (SME) review is automatically created as a placeholder as applicants apply to an announcement. The Reviews page is where you modify, access, and send an SME Review.

Review Information

The Review Information page is where the HR User adds or updates basic information about the review such as the review’s name, due date, and any instructions needed.



Each SME Evaluation Assessment tied to a vacancy can be sent only once on a review. The same SME Evaluation Assessment cannot be sent on more than one review per vacancy.

Online Help has instructions for Configuring a Subject Matter Expert (SME) review:

<https://support-usastaffing.opm.gov/hc/en-us/articles/45424305368851-Configuring-a-subject-matter-expert-SME-review>

Review Assignments

The Review Assignments page is where you select the SMEs who will conduct the Structured Resume Review. HR Users should ensure they are only selecting Hiring Manager Users who have received the proper training and are qualified to act as an SME in this context. USA Staffing does not automatically add the requester as one of the reviewers, because they might not be considered an SME. HR users may still manually assign the Requester if they would like the Hiring Manager to be involved in the review process Add as many SMEs, including tiebreakers, as needed.

Online Help has instructions for adding a reviewer to a review:

<https://support-usastaffing.opm.gov/hc/en-us/articles/45424342464147-Adding-a-reviewer-to-a-review>



If the individual does not appear in the search results, try adjusting your search criteria. If they still do not appear, you will need to confirm they have an account in USA Staffing before proceeding.

After sending the review, if an SME Reviewer changes roles, leaves the organization, or for any other reason should not be involved in the review, HR users can mark the SME Reviewer as “Inactive”. An “Inactive” SME Reviewer will no longer be assigned new evaluations but remain available to correct justifications as needed. It is not recommended that HR mark SME Reviewers as “Inactive” simply because they are unavailable temporarily.

Completing the SME Review

Monitoring Evaluation Progress

HR Users can monitor the SMEs’ progress in the Evaluation Progress and Overview sections of the Evaluations page. These sections display the total number of SME Evaluations tied to the review, how many tiebreaker evaluations are needed, and the ratio of applicant evaluations completed, as well as progress bars showing the number of evaluations in each status.

If a SME Evaluator recuses themselves from an applicant evaluation, a banner will appear to alert the HR User(s) that additional actions may be needed. This information can also be found on the Recusals tab.

Online Help has more information about the evaluations page:

<https://support-usastaffing.opm.gov/hc/en-us/articles/45424406377491-Subject-Matter-Expert-SME-Review-Evaluations-Overview>

Reviewing Evaluation

It is a best practice for SMEs to provide a justification that supports their evaluation decision. Evaluation justifications assist HR in the final review of an applicant’s qualification. Also, if SMEs

disagree on one or more specialized experience requirement(s), a third tiebreaker SME must review the justifications from the two SMEs to make a final determination.

Once an SME Reviewer submits an evaluation, it is the HR User's responsibility to review the documentation relative to the rating. The HR User either accepts it or returns it to the SME so they can amend one or more justification notes as needed. The HR User enters a message for the SME explaining why their justification needs amendment.

Below are examples of acceptable justification language:

When rating 'Yes' (resume reflects the required experience), indicate where in the resume you found support for your rating (i.e., year(s) experience gained, as well as position title as needed for clarity).

- "Assessment Consultant, 9/19 – 12/20"
- "Personnel Psychologist, 2019 – 2021"

When rating 'No' (resume does not reflect the required experience), indicate that the resume reflects insufficient evidence of the target experience, providing justification needed to help others retrace your decision.

- "Resume reflects insufficient evidence of 'Conducting Job Analysis.' See May 2022 – Present. Only 6 months experience in conducting job analysis."
- "Resume reflects insufficient evidence of 'Developing Assessments for Employee Selection.' See 2019-2021. Relevant experience but at the Grade 11 level only."

SMEs are expected to follow the general evaluation justification guidelines above when making a tiebreaker evaluation. In addition, they are expected to evaluate and reference the justifications from the other two SMEs in writing up their documentation. See samples below.

- Sample 1: "I do not agree with SME 1 that the applicant has experience to qualify them for Conducting Job Analysis. The job analysis experience referenced by the applicant exceeds one year; however, it does not demonstrate a foundational understanding of the procedures required to carry out a job analysis that meets professional standards that would be required at Grade 12. I agree with SME 2 that the applicant has not properly demonstrated experience qualifying them for Conducting Job Analysis."
- Sample 2: "I agree with SME 1 that the applicant has demonstrated required experience in Developing Assessments for Employee Selection. SME 2 indicated the applicant did not have relevant assessment development experience; however, the applicant developed structured interviews, biodata instruments, and work samples over a two-year period (see Personnel Psychologist, 2019-2021)."

Online Help has instructions for viewing an applicant evaluation:

<https://support-usastaffing.opm.gov/hc/en-us/articles/45424353299859-Viewing-an-applicant-evaluation>

Online Help has instructions for Accepting an applicant evaluation based on subject matter expert review:

<https://support-usastaffing.opm.gov/hc/en-us/articles/45424322964755-Accepting-an-applicant-evaluation-based-on-subject-matter-expert-review>

Online Help has instructions for returning a subject matter expert evaluation:

<https://support-usastaffing.opm.gov/hc/en-us/articles/45424391501075-Returning-a-subject-matter-expert-evaluation>



Once HR accepts all SME evaluations associated to the applicant, a final rating for the Structured Resume Review assessment is determined. At this point, HR Users cannot return any evaluations for amendment and cannot manually add the applicant back into the SME evaluation queue.

Implementation Success Factors

As you develop and apply this assessment method into your hiring process remember these key factors are associated with a successful implementation of a Structured Resume Review.

- Completing the online, self-paced Structured Resume Review training
- Creating a plan with realistic timelines, including gaining buy-in among key stakeholders
- Coordinating with key stakeholders early and often, including SMEs to ensure their availability for review of the specialized experience statements, training, and rating
- A careful review of the specialized experience statements and training/calibration to ensure all SMEs are interpreting them in the same way
- USA Staffing system knowledge and experience
- Teamwork among key stakeholders, including checking in with SMEs and updating them on progress
- Ongoing evaluation, making improvements as needed.